

# **EXHIBIT B**

SECOND DECLARATION OF WILLIAM BULLARD IN  
SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY  
JUDGMENT - 24

Case No. 2:17-cv-00223-RMP

1/8/2018

Don't Repeal Country-of-Origin Labeling - Consumers Union Policy & Action

# Don't repeal country-of-origin labeling on food Congress should keep COOL; U.S. consumers want to know where their food comes from

Published: June 12, 2015 10:10 AM

Food labels give you important information about the products you put in your shopping cart and, ultimately, on your table. But one of the labels that lets you know where your groceries come from is under legislative siege.

When you buy certain meat and poultry products there's usually country-of-origin labeling—or COOL—that tells you where the food was born, raised, and slaughtered. Those standards, passed by Congress in both 2002 and 2008 and overseen by the U.S. Department of Agriculture, were developed to give you valuable information when you're shopping. In the event of a food-borne illness outbreak, for example, country-of-origin labeling can help you avoid potential risks or easily identify products that you prefer.



Are you willing to buy food without knowing where it comes from?

At Consumers Union, the policy and advocacy arm of Consumer Reports, we strongly support country-of-origin labeling. You deserve the right to know where the meat you eat was raised. American consumers overwhelmingly support these labels. Our surveys have consistently shown that more than 90 percent of consumers would prefer to have a country-of-origin label on the meat they buy. (Tell us what you think by adding a comment at the bottom of this article.)

**Read about Consumer Reports' work on chicken and shrimp safety, and get more information in our Food Safety & Sustainability Guide.**

But legislation moving right now in Congress would repeal country-of-origin labeling and take away this important consumer resource. The bill (H.R. 2393) comes in the wake of a World Trade Organization ruling against the American rules for COOL, saying the labeling put Mexican and Canadian meat imports at an unfair disadvantage. But the proposed repeal goes even further than the WTO case, repealing country-of-origin labeling for products that were not even covered by the case, including chicken and ground beef.

We don't think that Congress should be intimidated by other countries' efforts to water down our labeling standards and repeal country-of-origin labeling. This week, Consumers Union sent a letter to the House of Representatives cautioning them from doing away with the labeling standards and, rather, urging the U.S. to negotiate a settlement with Mexico and Canada.

We were disappointed that the legislation passed the House, but Consumers Union will continue to fight any repeal of these vital labeling laws. The legislation now moves to the Senate for consideration. In 2013, Consumers Union backed a letter by a bipartisan group of 31 senators— 28 of whom are still in office—to Secretary of Agriculture Tom Vilsack and U.S. Trade Representative Ron Kirk in support of strong COOL rules that put Americans first. Despite this support for COOL in the upper chamber, it's as important as ever that Congress hears from consumers.

Join us, make your voice heard, and let your lawmakers know you oppose the repeal of country-of-origin labeling.

This feature is part of a regular series by Consumers Union, the policy and advocacy arm of Consumer Reports. The nonprofit organization advocates for product safety, financial reform, safer food, health reform, and other consumer issues in Washington, D.C., the states, and in the marketplace.

Read past installments of our Policy & Action feature.



20 Comments

Sort by



Add a comment...

**Rick Allen**

<https://www.consumerreports.org/cro/news/2015/06/dont-repeal-country-of-origin-labeling-on-food/index.htm>

1/4

## SECOND DECLARATION OF WILLIAM BULLARD IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT - 25

Case No. 2:17-cv-00223-RMP

1/8/2018

Don't Repeal Country-of-Origin Labeling - Consumers Union Policy & Action



also, I like to buy locally as much as I can. If the label says "Mexico" and not "stockton, CA" I don't buy it..... I wish the Gov. could keep things in that already works -----" If it ain't broke, don't fix it"

Like · Reply · Jan 11, 2016 2:27pm



**Rick Allen**

how can I know if I'm buying quality food otherwise? we should have the right to know where our foods come from.... I vote to keep the COOL.

Like · Reply · Jan 11, 2016 2:24pm



**Sonya Shearer Griffin** · San Saba, Texas

Keep country of origin. We deserve to know where our meat comes from. I do not want to eat meat processed in unsanitary conditions. I cannot believe my government would turn against the people they serve and not put our welfare first, again! Rep. Conaway is from my Texas District. I Will spread the word about him to this farm and ranch.area. I will work to see he is not reelected.

Like · Reply · Nov 26, 2015 12:01am



**Paul Hayward** · Plymouth State University

I AGREE with your stance and will support your efforts!

Like · Reply · Jul 26, 2015 3:12pm



**Becky Vail Anderson**

I am a Registered Dietitian and I support Country of Origin Labeling (COOL) 100%. We have a right and a need to know where our beef & poultry were bred, raised and slaughtered. The health of our children and families should not be held hostage to the trade demands of any country. For example, a single case of Mad Cow Disease would cause panic and devastate the beef industry and undermine our confidence in our USDA, not to mention the damage to the health of those exposed to contaminated beef products. Our clothing and knick-knacks have country of origin on their labels, so how can we not require country of origin labeling on the food we put in our bodies and feed our children and families?

Like · Reply · Jun 21, 2015 10:46pm



**Cindy Anderson** · University of South Florida

I want to know where my food comes from!! We should all have the right to choose what we eat and who prepares it. We choose restaurants that way...the ones with low standards either do a poor amount of business or go out of business. Let these other countries prove that they are holding to high standards of food preparation, and people will buy their food. Our own government should not hide this information from us. This is just asking for trouble.

Like · Reply · 1 · Jun 18, 2015 6:00am



**Phyllis Koop Boileau**

It's interesting how neither consumers reports and everyone else here ignore the comment made by Timothy Grad. The repeal of COOL is not about meat from China, Japan, Australia, etc. It has to do with livestock shared between Mexico, Canada and the USA. Cattle and hogs are traded at all ages between our 3 countries. COOL placed an onus to segregate cattle from Canada and Mexico separately through all stages. All the extra costs created a big discount to calves and breeding stock purchased from Canada or Mexico. This despite Canadian meats often being a superior product. Ever heard of Canadian bacon. Obama's amendments in response to a previous WTO decision against it made it even more distorting. Hence the WTO final decision in favor of Canada.This Law was originally brought in by lobbying from Midwest US ranchers. What do you think their true motivation was?

Like · Reply · Jun 17, 2015 10:04am



**Phyllis Koop Boileau**

Correction: the word "neither" above should be "both".  
Note: An editing option would be a plus.

Like · Reply · Jun 17, 2015 10:12am



**Julie Miller**

But if they repeal it, it will be about the meat from those countries because we won't know if it's from them either. They need to amend it, not repeal it to fix the problem. I don't think the future Canada or Mexico but not the best

<https://www.consumerreports.org/cro/news/2015/06/dont-repeal-country-of-origin-labeling-on-food/index.htm>

2/4

SECOND DECLARATION OF WILLIAM BULLARD IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT - 26

Case No. 2:17-cv-00223-RMP

1/8/2018

Don't Repeal Country-of-Origin Labeling - Consumers Union Policy & Action

fix the problem. I don't think it's fair to Canada or Mexico but going back in time on food labels isn't the answer. Also, I love Canadian bacon, but the Canadian bacon that we know in the US isn't a Canadian thing. Their "Canadian Bacon" is totally different. Not even smoked apparently. Thanks for the informative post. I hate it when half the story is left out and people are making decisions with out all the facts.

Like · Reply · Jul 3, 2015 1:54pm



**Patricia Burke-Chin**

I would like to keep the country of origin on all foods product including GMO products. I would rather fresh natural products. It is our right to know.

Like · Reply · Jun 17, 2015 2:25am



**Dawn Dickinson Peil** · Works at Self-Employed

What we don't know won't hurt us - right??

Like · Reply · Jun 16, 2015 12:28am



**Nancy Oliver** · Boise, Idaho

Sad to say this is more political junk that leaves Americans scratching their heads. What are they thinking? I have little enough faith with the FDA here overseeing things, now meat processed in China? They have enough trouble in political areans with us (and Japan) and I would trust their sanitation? They can't even keep their own air clean. We need to have more food security not less.

Like · Reply · 4 · Jun 18, 2015 11:27am · Edited



**Phyllis Koop Boileau**

Why don't you read the comments made By Michael Conaway. [http://www.rollcall.com/.../country\\_of\\_origin\\_labeling...](http://www.rollcall.com/.../country_of_origin_labeling...)

Perhaps you will have the rest of the story. China and most of Asia are importers of meat. They eat more then they produce. All comments about China in regards to beef and pork are just "red herrings".

Like · Reply · Jun 17, 2015 10:35am



**Nancy Oliver** · Boise, Idaho

Phyllis Koop Boileau I don't eat a lot of meat anyway, but I still think things should be labelled. What's to hide???

Like · Reply · 3 · Jun 18, 2015 11:28am

Load 10 more comments

Facebook Comments Plugin

Like 0 Share Tweet G+ Save

Consumer Support

Our Site

Products & Services

Account Settings

A-Z Index

Buy a Car:

1/8/2018

Don't Repeal Country-of-Origin Labeling - Consumers Union Policy & Action

[Customer Care](#)  
[Report a Safety Problem](#)  
[Career Opportunities](#)  
[Give a Gift](#)

[Product Index](#)  
[Car Index](#)  
[Video Index](#)  
[Canada Extra  
en Español](#)  
[Media Room](#)  
[Newsletters](#)

[New Cars](#)  
[Used Cars](#)  
[Books & Magazines](#)

**Our Network**

[Consumers Union](#)  
[Consumerist](#)  
[Consumer Health Choices](#)

[About Us](#)

[Subscribe](#)

[Donate](#)

[View Recent & Past Issues](#)  
[5 Year Index](#)

© 2006 - 2017 Consumer Reports  
[Privacy Policy](#) [User Agreement](#) [Ad Choices](#)